

Aberdeen City Council

Financial Statements Audit Plan for 2009/10

External Audit Report No: 2010-02

Draft Issued: 11 May 2010

Final Issued: 27 May 2010



Contents

| | | | Page |
|--------------|-------------------------------|---|---------|
| 1. | Executive Summary | | 1 - 2 |
| 2. | Accounts Preparation | | 3 - 4 |
| 3. | Audit Scope and Approach | | 5 - 9 |
| 4. | Interim Audit Work | | 10 - 17 |
| 5. | Issues for the Year-End Audit | | 18 – 19 |
| | | | |
| Apper | ndix I | Action Plan | 20 - 28 |
| Appendix II | | Follow-up 2008/09 Action Plan | 29 - 32 |
| Appendix III | | Follow-up 2007/08 HB/ CTB Management Letter | 33 - 34 |
| Apper | ndix IV | Acronyms | 35 |

Restriction on Use

This report has been prepared in accordance with our responsibilities under International Statements of Auditing and Audit Scotland's Code of Audit Practice for the audit of the financial statements of Aberdeen City Council.

We take this opportunity to remind you that:

- This report has been prepared for the sole use of Aberdeen City Council its Audit and Risk Committee and will be shared with the Accounts Commission and Audit Scotland
- No responsibility is assumed by us to any other person who may choose to rely on it for his or her own purposes
- This report sets out the findings from the specific areas covered by our review as well as our review of internal audit. Our audit does not necessarily disclose every weakness and for this reason the matters referred to in this report may not be the only shortcomings which exist.



1. Executive Summary

Introduction and Background

- 1. The purpose of this plan is to provide Aberdeen City Council (the Council) and the Finance Team with a clear understanding of our approach to the audit of the financial statements for the year ended 31 March 2010 and to provide an update of our interim audit work to date.
- 2. This document outlines:
 - the accounts preparation expectations
 - our audit scope and approach
 - interim audit work to date
 - the issues for our year-end audit
- 3. The Working Papers Requested List (WPRL), which has already been issued to the Corporate Accounting Manager, is an important part of our approach and sets out our understanding regarding the documents the Council has agreed to prepare in order to facilitate our audit.
- 4. Information has been gathered through discussion with Council officers, including the Corporate Accounting Manager, the Internal Audit Manager and members of the Finance team, review of internal audit reports and files and the financial monitoring reports, and from the assessment of the key financial controls. We have considered planning guidance issued to us by Audit Scotland for 2009/10.
- 5. Our audit timetable and planned audit outputs were detailed in our **Risk Assessment**, **Annual Audit Plan and Fee Proposal for 2009/10** (Annual Plan), Report 2010-01 issued on 18 February 2010 and have been agreed with the Council's management and approved by the Audit and Risk Committee.

Overall Conclusion on Interim Work to Date

- 6. From the interim work carried out to date we are satisfied that we have assessed the level of assurance to be gained from the financial control environment at the Council for producing financial accounts for the year ended 31 March 2010. For the majority of the main financial systems we have assessed either full or substantial assurance. The exception is the Fixed Asset Register which is limited as the main controls are carried out after the year-end. This is subject to reviewing internal audit reports and files that are still in progress and completing the key control testing for the final few months of the year prior to the start of our year-end audit. Full details are included in Section 4.
- 7. We are pleased to report that for the main systems the majority of key controls appear to be in place. We have however identified some control weaknesses that may impact on our audit approach for the year-end:
 - while the payroll suspense account is reviewed and cleared throughout the year, it is currently only fully reconciled at the year end
 - reconciliations between the Assessor's records and the Council Tax system are currently only carried out at the year end
 - controls over Housing Rents dwellings reconciliations should be improved
- 8. Recommendations which should help strengthen internal controls are included in an Action Plan at Appendix I, together with further detail of our audit findings. The recommendations have been agreed with senior officers at the Council.



1. Executive Summary

Overall Conclusion on Interim Work to Date (cont'd)

- 9. We have identified some national and local issues that we have assessed as higher risk for the preparation and audit of the Council's financial statements. These are set out in Tables 5 and 6 in Section 5.
- 10. We have followed the Council's progress in implementing the actions agreed within our 2008/09 Financial Statements Audit Plan (FSAP) and our 2007/08 HB/ CTB Management Letter and included updates at Appendix II and III. We are pleased to note that all but two of the recommendations made have been fully implemented. We will follow up progress made with these final actions during our year-end audit.

Acknowledgements

11. We would like to take this opportunity to thank all the officers within the Council who assisted us in gathering information for this plan.



2. Accounts Preparation

Introduction

12. Our audit of the Council's financial statements, and the agreed audit fee are based on the timely receipt of disclosure compliant accounts and supporting working papers prepared to an acceptable professional standard; the availability of key officers responsible for the preparation of the financial papers; and access to further information or explanations necessary to support the financial statements and the significant areas of judgement applied in the preparation of the financial statements.

Format of the Accounts

- 13. The financial statements should be prepared in accordance with the "Code of Practice on Local Authority Accounting in the United Kingdom 2009 A Statement of Recommended Practice" (SORP), which is issued by the CIPFA/LASAAC Joint Committee.
- 14. The SORP is reviewed and updated annually. The 2009 SORP which applies to the 2009/10 financial statements was issued in August 2009.
- 15. For 2009/10, the most significant change to the SORP is in respect of the accounting requirements for private finance initiative (PFI) and similar contracts. Accounting treatment for PFI and similar contracts is no longer based on FRS5 but on an interpretation of IFRIC 12 Service Concession Arrangements contained in the Government's Financial Reporting Manual.
- 16. There are also amendments in respect of accounting for non-domestic rates.

Responsibility for the Preparation of the Accounts

- 17. The financial statements are an essential part of accounting for the stewardship of resources made available to the Council and reporting its financial performance for the use of those resources. It is the responsibility of the Council, and the Head of Finance as the proper officer, to prepare the financial statements in accordance with statutory timescales and all relevant regulatory requirements. This means:
 - the Council has to make arrangements for the proper administration of its financial
 affairs and to secure that one of its officers has the responsibility for the administration
 of those affairs and to manage its affairs to secure economic, efficient and effective use
 of resources and safeguard its assets
 - the proper officer is responsible for the preparation of the financial statements and ensuring that they are in accordance with proper practices as set out in the SORP; ensuring that suitable accounting policies have been selected and applied consistently; judgements and estimates made are reasonable and prudent; proper accounting records have been maintained and that reasonable steps have been taken to prevent and detect fraud and other irregularities
- 18. A series of meetings with the Council's officers has been held to consider preparation of the financial statements and agree our requirements as set out in the WPRL. This document has been updated to take account of feedback from the Corporate Accounting Manager and his team to include the delegated responsible officers for each area.
- 19. Officers have confirmed that "year-end close down procedures" were issued to appropriate staff before 31 March 2010.



2. Accounts Preparation

Responsibility for the Preparation of the Accounts (cont'd)

- 20. The main contacts for our audit team in the course of the financial statements audit are the Corporate Accounting Manager and the Senior Accountant for operational issues. Any significant audit issues arising during the course of the year-end audit will also be notified to the Head of Finance, who has overall responsibility for the preparation and co-ordination of the financial statements.
- 21. We have made enquiries about the Council's processes for the preparation of the Annual Governance Statement and plan to review the process and draft statement during the year-end audit. Any significant weaknesses in controls identified during our year-end audit will be brought to the attention of management for inclusion in the statement.



Scope of the Audit

- 22. Our responsibilities as independent auditors primarily derive from the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973 and are summarised in Audit Scotland's Code of Audit Practice (the Code) approved by the Accounts Commission for Scotland, and guided by the auditing profession's auditing standards and ethical guidance. These responsibilities are to:
 - audit the financial statements and place a certificate (independent auditors' report/opinion) on the statements stating that the audit has been conducted in accordance with part VII of the Act
 - satisfy ourselves that the financial statements have been prepared in accordance with all applicable statutory requirements
 - satisfy ourselves that proper accounting practices have been observed in the preparation
 of the financial statements
- 23. In forming our opinion for inclusion in our audit certificate we are required to report on the following:
 - whether the financial statements give a true and fair view of the financial position of the Council as at 31 March 2010 and its income and expenditure for the year then ended
 - if the Foreword is not consistent with the financial statements
 - if the Council has not kept proper accounting records, or if we have not received all the information and explanations we require for our audit
- 24. We review whether the Annual Governance Statement complies with the SORP and report if it does not comply or if it is misleading or inconsistent with other information we are aware of from our audit. We are not required to consider whether the statement covers all risks and controls, or form an opinion on the effectiveness of the Council's corporate governance procedures or its risk and control procedures.
- 25. In addition, we must consider the other information published with the financial statements and consider the implications for our report if we become aware of any apparent misstatements or material inconsistencies with the financial statements.

Audit Approach

- 26. Our overall audit approach was set out in our Annual Plan. In summary, this approach is based on our annual integrated assessment of risks across our responsibilities detailed in the Code in relation to the finance (including our audit certificate on the financial statements), governance and performance aspects of the wider audit model. This approach includes:
 - understanding the business of the Council and risk exposures which could impact on the financial statements
 - assessing the key internal controls for the main financial systems and considering how risk exposure in the systems could affect the financial statements



Audit Approach (Cont'd)

26. Continued

- identifying major transaction streams, balances and areas of estimation, understanding how the Council will include these in the financial statements, and developing audit tests for these
- assessing the risk of material misstatement in financial statements, in conjunction with our evaluation of inherent risk and control environment risk as part of our integrated risk assessment approach
- determining the nature, timing and extent of our audit work programme to provide us with sufficient appropriate evidence as to whether the financial statements are free from material misstatement
- 27. Through this approach, we have also considered and documented the sources of assurance which will allow us to make best use of our resources and focus testing on higher risk areas during the audit of the financial statements. The main areas of assurance for the audit come from planned management action, internal audit coverage and reliance on systems of internal control. Management action being relied on for 2009/10 includes:
 - comprehensive year-end close down procedures and timetable issued to relevant staff
 - clear responsibilities for the production of the accounts and supporting working papers
 - the delivery of unaudited accounts to agreed timescales with an appropriate working paper package and completed WPRL
 - identification of other bodies/entities and the appraisal of their materiality for inclusion in group accounts
 - completion of key elements of the internal audit programme for 2009/10
- 28. The audit of the financial statements is completed over three stages. The first stage was carried out between November 2009 and February 2010 as part of our "understanding the business" review, which fed into the integrated risk assessment approach. The specific output delivered as a result of this first stage was our Annual Plan.
- 29. The second stage was planned to be carried out over the period from March to June 2010. This includes our financial control evaluation work and audit testing of the key controls for the main financial systems we plan to rely on for our financial statements audit, and our review of the Council's financial monitoring reports available prior to our year-end audit commencing.
- 30. At the time of this report, we have considered the results of our financial control evaluation work and the provision of internal audit services. The outcome of this evaluation is set out in Section 4. We will review the internal audit files and update our evaluation to take account of the results of their work. On other areas where internal audit has yet to formally report their findings and where we have still to review their files we will update our evaluation to take account of their findings. This further evaluation will be considered in the context of its impact on our financial statements audit.



Audit Approach (Cont'd)

31. The third and final stage will be carried out during July to October 2010. We will focus our year-end audit on the significant risks and audit objectives for disclosure and significant areas of judgement included in the financial statements.

Materiality

- 32. Materiality is one of the fundamental accounting principles that should be complied with in preparing an authority's accounts. The SORP states that "Materiality is the final test of what information should be given in a particular set of financial statements...., materiality is a threshold quality ensuring that the information is of such significance as to justify its inclusion in the financial statements. An item of information is material to the financial statements if its misstatement or omission might reasonably be expected to influence assessments of the authority's stewardship, economic decisions, or comparisons with other entities, based on those financial statements. If there are two or more similar items the materiality of the items in aggregate, as well as of items individually, needs to be considered."
- 33. We are required to consider materiality and its relationship with audit risk when planning the nature, timing and extent of our audit and conducting our audit programme.
- 34. Specifically, with regard to the financial statements, we assess the materiality of uncorrected errors and misstatements, both individually and collectively. We report all material and significant audit adjustments to the draft accounts and significant control weaknesses identified during our audit to those charged with governance before concluding our year-end audit.
- 35. We use a base calculation which is derived from the gross expenditure figure in the accounts as a materiality guide for our audit. This is calculated upon receipt of the draft accounts and advised to the Corporate Accounting Manager and his team. Both materiality and significance levels (5% of materiality) are used to list potential audit adjustments arising in the course of the audit and will be reported to those charged with governance. Items below our level of significance will be deemed trivial and may not be reported.

Classes of Transactions, Estimates, Other Account Balances and Disclosures

- 36. In addition to our calculation of materiality, we use our understanding of the Council to determine which transactions are material and significant to the financial statements.
- 37. Our audit approach requires that we identify significant classes of transactions, estimates, other account balances and disclosures. We will develop audit objectives relating to each of these items and test the controls over each item based on our assessment of the risk of significant misstatement.
- 38. We have assessed financial instruments, pension fund (FRS 17) liabilities and other pensions transactions, year-end property revaluations and capital accounting entries, manual accruals, prepayments, and provisions as higher risk and will carry out substantive testing on these accounts during our year-end audit. Transactions in these areas are only processed at the year-end and they are not covered by our financial control evaluation work.



Fraud and Irregularity

- 39. It is the Council's responsibility to establish arrangements to prevent and detect fraud and other irregularity, including:
 - developing, promoting and monitoring compliance with standing orders and financial regulations
 - implementing strategies to prevent and detect fraud and other irregularity
 - receiving and investigating allegations of breaches of proper standards
- 40. We are required to consider the arrangements made by management. We will do this in a number of ways:
 - our risk-based audit approach will focus on specific areas of high risk and provide a reasonable expectation of detecting misstatements in the annual accounts resulting from fraud or irregularity
 - we will review the Technical Bulletins produced by Audit Scotland with regard to fraud reports in local authorities and ensure that the Council has adequate arrangements in place to prevent similar frauds occurring
 - we will examine the policies, strategies, standing orders and financial regulations issued by the Council to ensure that they deal adequately with fraud and corruption and provide a framework for exercising strong internal control.
- 41. We are also required to report any fraud above £5,000 to Audit Scotland and have agreed with the Council that we will be informed of any frauds if and when they are identified. We are not aware of any potential frauds occurring during 2009/10 other than those identified through the National Fraud Initiative.

Communication and Reporting

- 42. We will communicate regularly with officers in preparation for and during our audit of the financial statements. This communication should be two-way, and we encourage officers to have early discussions with us on any issues that may give rise to audit comment at a later date.
- 43. The Manager on site for the audit of the Financial Statements will be Karlyn Watt and the Audit Director will be Margaret Richardson. Cathie Wyllie is the partner responsible for signing the audit certificate. Issues arising during the audit should be brought to their attention. Contact details were supplied in our Annual Plan.
- 44. In accordance with International Standards on Auditing (ISA) 260, before issuing our audit certificate we will provide the Head of Finance, and those charged with governance (the Council's Audit & Risk Committee) with a report detailing any material and significant audit adjustments to the draft accounts and listing any unadjusted errors. Any significant control weaknesses and any significant matters which are identified during the course of the audit will also be included in this report, together with a copy of our proposed certificate.



Communication and Reporting (Cont'd)

- 45. Due to the timing of the cycle of meetings of the Audit & Risk Committee and the target date of 30 September for completion of the audit, there is a potential difficulty in being able to discuss the ISA 260 report with Members in advance of completion of the audit. We suggest that we meet with the Convener of the Audit & Risk Committee to discuss the report and then circulate the document to all Members of the Committee as part of the agenda papers for the next meeting for their information.
- 46. We may also produce a separate year-end management letter should there be any technical accounting issues arising during the audit that we feel should be brought to the attention of the Head of Finance and the accountants involved in the year-end accounts process. Our observations and suggested recommendations would be where we believe improvements could be made to either the accounts preparation or audit processes.
- 47. Finally, at the conclusion of our year-end audit we prepare and submit our annual audit report, the Report to Members and the Controller of Audit, which is the formal report to the Council's Audit & Risk Committee and Full Council about all aspects of our audit for 2009/10.



Introduction and Background

- 48. The Code identifies that 'it is the responsibility of the audited body to conduct its affairs and to put in place proper arrangements to ensure that its financial position is soundly based'. It is our responsibility as auditors to review and examine evidence that is relevant to these arrangements.
- 49. Our interim audit work as it relates to the financial statements audit included the following elements:
 - a review of the provision of internal audit
 - a review of internal audit work to date
 - our financial control evaluation review documenting, testing and assessing the key controls in place for the main financial systems
 - ongoing review of the financial position and budget monitoring reports.

Review of Internal Audit Provision

- 50. Due to the limited resources available within the Council's Internal Audit function, an external firm was appointed to carry out specific projects within the 2009/10 Audit Plan. For 2010/11, the internal audit provision will be fully outsourced.
- 51. In accordance with ISA 610, we carried out a review of the Council's framework for the provision of internal audit services. As reported in our Annual Plan, we confirmed that we can continue to place reliance on the work of internal audit for the current year.

Review of Internal Audit Files

- 52. In our Annual Plan we identified areas in internal audit's work programme for 2009/10 where we would expect to place reliance on their work for the audit of the financial statements. We identified the following files that we would want to feed into our financial control evaluation review:
 - Budget management process
 - Financial reporting readiness
 - Bank reconciliations
 - General ledger feeder systems
 - Other general ledger account reconciliations
 - Treasury management
 - Accounts receivable and collections
 - Housing capital expenditure and repairs budgets
 - IT Asset Management
 - IT General Controls
 - CRM/ Parking Fines



Review of Internal Audit Files (Cont'd)

53. Internal audit have concluded on their work to date as summarised in Table 1. We have reviewed the working paper files relating to these reviews and concluded that we can rely on their work.

Table 1: Internal Audit Conclusions

| Topic | Conclusion |
|---|------------------------------|
| Budget management process General ledger feeder systems | Satisfactory Satisfactory |
| CRM/ Parking Fines | Generally adequate |
| Treasury Management | Generally satisfactory |
| Accounts Receivable | Generally satisfactory |

- 54. We have reviewed the weaknesses identified by Internal Audit to date and have concluded that they are unlikely to have a material impact on the financial statements. Where appropriate we have designed specific substantive testing to address identified weaknesses.
- 55. The other internal audit reviews are in progress and are expected to be reported prior to the start of our year-end work. The reports and working paper files will be reviewed as soon as they are available and we will consider whether any of the findings are likely to have a material impact on the financial statements.
- 56. The Internal Audit Manager is responsible for preparing an annual assurance statement. Our review of this work will inform our review of the Annual Governance Statement published with the annual accounts.
- 57. It should be noted that we can rely fully on the work of internal audit without necessarily gaining full assurance on the controls in place. For example internal audit may not have tested the key controls within their review or may conclude that from controls tested the audit results do not provide full assurance that the controls are operating effectively. Where either scenario is reported we will consider the implications for our testing for the year-end audit.
- 58. We will report the extent of our actual reliance on internal audit's work and the level of assurance gained in our annual report.

Financial Control Evaluation

- 59. We have carried out a high level review of the key controls for the Council's main financial systems and carried out walkthrough tests to confirm that our understanding of these systems and the control environment is accurate. We have tested key controls up to the point of our review for all systems not tested by internal audit. The systems reviewed were the main Financial Ledger (including budget and actual figures), Payroll, Creditors ledger, Cheque Control, Fixed Assets Register, Non Domestic Rates, Council Tax, Housing Rents and Council Tax and Housing Benefit.
- 60. We used CIPFA's Hazard Identifiers to aid our documentation of the system and existing controls. Where we identified control weaknesses we have highlighted them on the control sheets. The responsible officers for each area have confirmed the factual accuracy of the documented controls.



Financial Control Evaluation (cont'd)

- 61. Further testing will be carried out at the start of our year-end audit, to confirm that the key controls have continued to operate in the period between our audit visit and the end of the financial year.
- 62. The evaluation of the Fixed Assets and Capital Accounting was restricted as most of the work in this area is carried out as part of year-end procedures. We therefore plan to carry out detailed testing during our year-end audit.
- 63. We are pleased to report that for all of the main financial systems reviewed the majority of the expected key controls appear to be in place. The main issues identified during our testing are noted below. Other less significant findings have been discussed with the responsible officer for each area. Recommendations which should help to strengthen internal control are included in the Action Plan at Appendix I, together with further details of our audit findings.
 - Payroll While the payroll suspense account is reviewed and cleared throughout the year, it is currently only fully reconciled at the year-end.
 - Creditors the control over ensuring evidence of receipt of goods before payment of invoices should be strengthened.
 - Council Tax Reconciliations between the Assessor's records and the Council Tax system are currently only carried out at the year end. An electronic interface between the two systems should be developed to enable reconciliations to be automatically performed whenever amendments to the Council Tax system are made. We raised this issue in our 2008/09 Action Plan (see Appendix II), however officers have advised that resource issues have prevented this from being implemented. We understand that dialogue has started with the Assessor for implementation in 2010/11.
 - Housing and Council Tax Benefit Controls over refund payments should be strengthened to ensure that all payments in excess of £1,000 are checked.
 - Non-Domestic Rates Annual billing for Non-Domestic Rates should be fully reconciled and documented at the time to ensure that the correct number of bills are sent out.
 - Non-Domestic Rates System information is currently being gathered manually on spreadsheets or handwritten notes. Checking data presented in this manner is time consuming and difficult, and staff resources mean that some records are no longer being maintained. The reporting capabilities of the system need to be reviewed and consideration should be given to reporting tools to allow system information to be extracted relatively quickly.
 - Housing Rents Controls over rent refunds should be strengthened to ensure that the
 total of refund approved is reconciled to the total processed in the rent system and the
 total amount paid through the main accounting system.
 - Housing Rents All rent account adjustments and transfers input into the rent system should be reviewed by an independent person.
 - Housing Rents Controls over changes to the rent dwellings masterfile should be improved by requiring two staff to authorise all proposed amendments and independently reconciling all rent dwelling movements to supporting documentation.



Financial Control Evaluation (cont'd)

- 64. From our testing of the HB/ CTB system, we noted that the restructured training team has developed and implemented a new training programme which is identifying and addressing training needs to ensure new and existing staff have both up to date knowledge and progressive training in the different aspects of HB/ CTB. This is highlighted as a good practice point.
- 65. We have followed up the recommendations made in our 2008/09 Financial Statements Audit Plan, Report 2009/03 issued on 26 May 2009 and included an update at Appendix II. In relation to Housing and Council Tax Benefit, we have also followed up the recommendations made in our 2007/08 Housing and Council Tax Benefit Subsidy Management Letter, Report 2009/05 issued on 30 June 2009 and included an update at Appendix III. We are pleased to note that all but two of the recommendations made have been fully implemented. Revised target dates for implementation have been provided for the recommendation relating still to be implemented. We will follow-up progress made with these during our year-end audit.
- 66. We have identified the key controls upon which we plan to place reliance for our financial statements audit. Where the expected key controls exist and are operating effectively we plan to take assurance from this and restrict our year-end testing.
- 67. The results from our evaluation have been considered in terms of the impact on the financial statements audit and on our audit opinion. We grade the level of assurance we can take using the following basis:

Table 2: Assurance grading

| Assurance Opinion | Assurance Description |
|-----------------------|---|
| Full Assurance | There is a sound system of control designed to achieve the system objectives (this may be subject to completing some control testing in the period up to the year-end). |
| Substantial Assurance | While there is a basically sound system there are some weaknesses that put some system objectives at risk |
| Limited Assurance | Weaknesses in the system of controls are such as to put the system objectives at risk or controls only operate at the year-end |
| No Assurance | Control is generally weak leaving the system open to significant error or abuse |

- 68. Where full or substantial assurance can be taken that the controls are operating effectively throughout the year within each of the main financial systems, we limit our testing at the financial statements audit phase. Where limited or no assurance can be taken on the main financial systems then we expand our detailed testing during the year-end audit.
- 69. The following table details the level of assurance we expect to take from our overall financial control evaluation of the main financial systems. A small amount of testing has still to be completed, to confirm that the key controls continued to operate for the full year. This work will be carried out at the start of our year-end audit.



Financial Control Evaluation (cont'd)

Table 3: Assumed Level of Assurance

| Main System | Level of Assurance |
|--|--|
| Main Financial Ledger Budgetary Control Payroll Debtors and Income Creditors and procurement Cash & Bank Treasury Management Council Tax Non-Domestic Rates Housing Rents Council Tax and Housing Benefit Fixed Asset Register | Substantial ³ Full ¹ Substantial ² Substantial ² Substantial ² Substantial ³ Substantial ² Limited (see para 62) |

¹ No issues identified during our testing of the period April 2009 to January 2010. The level of assurance will be re-considered following completion of control testing for February and March 2010.

Reliance on the Council's Controls

70. Management are expected to have a sufficient framework of controls in place such that we are able to rely on the following key controls for our year-end audit; as follows:

Table 4: Reliance on Council's Controls

| Main System | Expected Council's Controls |
|-----------------------|---|
| Main Financial Ledger | The final trial balance squares and reconciles to the final ledger prints. An audit trail is provided that tracks the final ledger balances to the key figures in the accounts. Back up is maintained for all significant journal entries and all suspense accounts have been reviewed and cleared at the year-end. All key control accounts (including VAT and Payroll Control accounts) are reviewed on a regular basis. Feeder system interfaces and batch processing are operating properly to ensure complete and accurate update of the ledger on a timely basis. |
| Budgetary Control | All significant variances and virements from the final approved budgets for the year are fully explained and have been reported to the Council regularly throughout the year. Reconciliation is provided detailing all significant movements and virements from the original to the final approved budget. |

Some weaknesses identified. Recommendations included in Action Plans at Appendix I and II or within Internal Audit reports.

The work of Internal Audit has still to be reported. The level of assurance will be re-considered following completion and review of Internal Audit's work.



| Main System | Expected Council's Controls |
|---------------------------|---|
| Payroll and Pensions | All changes to the payroll standing data including new starts and leavers during the year have been properly authorised. All payroll payments to staff have been made to bona fide employees of the Council and all deductions have been properly accounted for. Payroll exception reports are regularly monitored. All key payroll and pension accounts codes within the main ledger are regularly monitored and all payroll control and suspense accounts are regularly monitored. |
| Debtors and Income | All goods and services provided by the Council during the year have been properly authorised and invoiced or accrued by the year-end. All other income due to the Council has been properly accounted for. Cash received has been promptly banked intact and accounted for in the Debtors Control Account or as other income. Controls to ensure both the Debtors and financial ledgers are fully and completely updated on a timely basis. The Debtors Control Account is reconciled regularly with the outstanding Debtor balances. Controls are in place to ensure regular debt monitoring and recovery action. Authorised listing of bad debts written off for the year and full details of provisions made at the year-end. |
| Creditors and procurement | All goods ordered are properly authorised by the appropriate budget holder, matched with goods delivered and agreed to suppliers invoices prior to payments being authorised. The Council's procurement policies are followed and tendering arrangements in the Council's financial regulations are followed for all significant contracts. All payments in excess of £25,000 are independently checked. Exception reports are periodically reviewed to identify potential duplicate payments. Controls to ensure both the Creditors and financial ledgers are fully and completely updated on a timely basis to ensure all liabilities are recognised. The Creditors Control Account balance is regularly reconciled throughout the year to the outstanding creditor balances. |
| Treasury Management | All loans funds transactions, including advances, repayments and interest were properly authorised and are supported by the appropriate documentation held by the Treasury Management Team. |
| Cash & Bank | All of the Council's main bank and cash imprest accounts have been reconciled regularly throughout the year and reviewed by appropriate staff. The final bank reconciliation for the main account has been reconciled to the balance on the bank statements at the year-end and all significant outstanding transactions have been checked to the after date bank statements. All income received is processed and banked timeously in full. The cashiering system and the financial and other ledgers are correctly updated. All cheques and BACs runs are properly authorised and accounted for in the correct period. |
| Non Domestic Rates | All amendments to the property masterfile are supported by Grampian Joint Valuation Board documents. Updated parameters are independently checked to ensure these are correct. Checks are in place over the accuracy and completeness of billing. Refunds are authorised appropriately. Exemptions and reliefs are supported with adequate documentation. Cash received in the cash receipting system is reconciled to cash per the non-domestic rates system. The non-domestic rates system balances are reconciled to the main accounting system balances at year end. |



| Main System | Expected Council's Controls |
|---------------|--|
| Council Tax | All amendments to the property masterfile are supported by Grampian Joint Valuation Board documents. Updated parameters are independently checked to ensure these are correct. Checks are in place over the accuracy and completeness of billing. Refunds are authorised appropriately. Exemptions are supported with adequate documentation. Cash received in the cash receipting system is reconciled to cash per the council tax system. The council tax system balances are reconciled to the main accounting system balances at year end. |
| Housing Rents | All amendments to the property masterfile are independently checked to supporting documentation. Updated rent charges are independently checked to ensure these are correct. Void properties are monitored. Cash received in the cash receipting system is reconciled to cash per the housing rents system. Refunds are authorised and supported with adequate documentation. The housing rents system balances are reconciled to the main accounting system balances at year end. |
| System Access | Appropriate system access controls are in place for all of the above systems. |

Letters of Assurance and Confirmation

71. In accordance with Audit Scotland's guidance we have written to the Treasurer and the External Auditor of Grampian Valuation Joint Board to seek assurances in relation to the valuation services provided by the Board to the Council. To date we have still to receive responses from both; however, we will seek assurance before concluding our review.

Financial Position

General Fund

- 72. The original 2009/10 budget of £438.736 million included savings totalling £26.625 million. Recent reporting to the Finance and Resources Committee, based on ledger figures at 31 March 2010 has indicated that the Council is projecting an increase in the General Fund of £9.482 million in comparison with a budgeted breakeven position. This is being achieved by one-off savings of approximately £6.3 million through reduced capital financing costs as a result of a reduced capital programme and benefits achieved from rescheduling debt and a £6.099 million saving as a result of a review of past VAT claims. The operational budget cost pressures are currently predicted to exceed the budget by £1.144 million.
- 73. In taking into account the above projected underspend for the current year, the latest projected uncommitted General Fund balance at 31 March 2010 is £14.149 million, which comprises:



Financial Position (cont'd)

| | £m |
|--|---------|
| Uncommitted balance at 1 April 2009 | 8.784 |
| Movement on General Fund balance (see above) | 9.482 |
| Revised Uncommitted General Fund Working Balance | 18.266 |
| Earmarking of Road Maintenance funding from Transport Scotland | 0.117 |
| Release of Equal Pay provisions through Consent to | (3.600) |
| Borrow arrangements already in place | |
| Recommended earmarking of General Fund Balance to | 7.600 |
| Support the Staff Reduction Exercise | |
| Projected Uncommitted General Fund Work Balance | 14.149 |
| at 31 March 2010 | |

Housing Revenue Account

74. The Housing Revenue Account projected out-turn position at 28 February 2010 reports a balanced budget, with a potential increase of the capital from current revenue due to the overall favourable position principally the result of reduced capital financing costs.

Housing Capital Programme

75. As at 28 February 2010, the Council reported a projected out-turn position of £52.547 million on the Housing Capital Programme, compared to the approved budget for 2009/10 of £51.747 million. This additional expenditure will be funded from additional Capital from Current Revenue. This is as a result of carry forward of various projects from 2008/09 principally the structural repairs of the multi storey flats.

Non-Housing Capital Programme

- 76. As at 31 March 2010, the Council reported a projected out-turn position of £65.446 million on the Non-Housing Capital Programme compared to the revised budget of £64.940 million. To ensure that the overall programme remains within the funded level, a further £0.506 million of slippage will require to be identified. Based on information from previous years and the low level of spend to date, the Council anticipate that this level of slippage is achievable, once all end of year transactions are processed.
- 77. We have considered the impact of the above projected variances against the budgets in determining the higher risk areas that may impact on our financial statements audit. We will review the final position during our year-end audit.
- 78. We will review the overall movement in the Council's reserves and the final closing balance. We will also monitor the level of uncommitted balances in respect of the Council's policy of maintaining a level of 2.5% to 3% of the revenue budget.



5. Issues for the Year-End Audit

Specific Risk Areas

- 79. Our Annual Plan highlighted a number of business and audit risk areas some of which may impact upon the financial statements and the audit opinion. For the purposes of the specific year-end planning we have identified some national and local issues that we have assessed as higher risk of impacting on the preparation and audit of the Council's financial statements. These are set out in tables 5 and 6 below.
- 80. At the start of our year-end audit we will meet with the Corporate Accounting Manager to discuss these issues and any further issues that have arisen during the accounts preparation process, to update our planning.

Table 5: National Issues

| Issue | Detail |
|--|---|
| 10000 | Dottuii |
| Accounting for PFI Contracts | Accounting treatment for PFI and similar contracts is no longer based on FRS 5 but on an interpretation of IFRIC 12 Service Concession Arrangements contained in the Government's Financial Reporting Manual. Appropriate disclosures to be made in the financial statements. |
| FRS17 Pensions Funds Liabilities | The impact of changes to the pension funds' regulations needs to be considered. Ensure disclosures are as required for 2009/10. |
| Equal Pay and Single Status | Provision and disclosure in the accounts relating to equal pay claims and implementation of the new terms and conditions under single status. |
| Non Domestic Rates (NDR) | NDR are collected by the Council as an agent on behalf of central government and should be accounted for accordingly. |
| Significant Trading Operations | Requirement to break even over a rolling three year period. |
| Whole of Government Accounts | The deadline for completing the audited return has been brought forward to 30 September 2010. Arrangements need to be put in place to ensure that this deadline is achieved. |
| International Financial Reporting Standards (IFRS) | The Council will need to restate 2009/10 comparative information onto an IFRS basis, and disclose a restated 1 April 2009 IFRS-based balance sheet. From initial discussions, the Council are making progress in preparing for full IFRS implementation. |

81. The key message from our 2008/09 management letter was that there was a requirement for greater management of the year-end accounts preparation process; there needed to be a closer scrutiny by management of the draft accounts and associated working papers; and that a clear structure needed to be put in place to ensure that staff have sufficient time and knowledge to plan in advance of the year-end work, prepare the accounts in compliance with the SORP and ensure that there is evidence of a timely review prior to the audit process.



5. Issues for the Year-End Audit

Specific Risk Areas (cont'd)

Table 6: Local Issues

| Issue | Detail |
|--|---|
| Actions from 2008/09 Year-end Management Letter | Actions outstanding from our 2007/08 year-end management letter along with those raised in our 2008/09 letter need to be addressed. |
| AECC Funding | Changes to the loans and funding arrangements for the AECC, approved by Council in February 2010, need to be fully disclosed in the financial statements. |
| 3Rs Project | Changes to the agreement made during the year, including the restructuring and changes to the Facilities Management provider, need to be fully disclosed in the financial statements. |
| Capital Funds and other funds and reserves | Must comply with the statutory regulations relating to the use of reserves. |
| Statement of Total Recognised Gains and Losses (STRGL) | Any 'other' gains / losses to be fully explained and reconciled |
| Accounts to meet the SORP disclosure requirements in all material aspects. | Early use of CIPFA's Disclosure checklist to ensure compliance. |



1. Payroll

Control Objective: Payroll data is accurately entered into e-financials Key Control: Payroll suspense account is reviewed and cleared monthly

| Observation and Risk | Recommendation | Management Response | |
|---|---|--|-----|
| While there was evidence that the payroll suspense account was reviewed throughout the year, formal reconciliations are not being carried out on a monthly basis. The only formal reconciliation, independently signed off by the Payroll Manager, is carried out at the year-end. There is a risk that suspense items are not cleared timeously. | R1 A reconciliation of the Payroll suspense account should be carried out on a monthly basis, and independently signed off by the Payroll Manager. This should be done in a similar format to that prepared for the year-end. | Payroll suspense accours basis, at the end of each 30th. As part of the promonth, there will be a significant with the second of | |
| | | Graue | ן ט |



2. Creditors

Control Objective: Invoices are paid correctly

Key Control: An invoice requires a delivery note, signed to say that all items have been received and are correct, prior to payment.

| Observation and Risk | Recommendation | Management Response | |
|---|--|---------------------|--|
| From a sample of 24 paid invoices selected, we noted 10 invoices had inadequate evidence of the receipt of goods. This included absence of delivery note and absence of annotation of delivery note. There is therefore a risk that invoices are paid incorrectly for goods not received. | R2 Invoices should not be passed for payment without appropriate evidence of the receipt of goods. | | |



| 2. | Creditors (Cont'd) | | | |
|----|----------------------|----------------|---|--|
| | Observation and Risk | Recommendat | ion Mana | ement Response |
| | | R2 (Continued) | linked to Infosmart, will issue an instruct | • |
| | | | No later than: | Financial Services Manager 1 August 2010 |
| | | | Grade | С |



3. Housing Rents

Control Objective: Rent refunds are valid and appropriately supported with documentation Key Control: Refunds are authorised and supported with adequate documentation

| Observation and Risk | Recommendation | Manageme | ent Response |
|--|--|---|---|
| Cash refunds are recorded in a manual cash refunds book, along with the signature of the cashier who made the refund. These refunds are not spot checked to determine whether the refunds are appropriate and are not reconciled to the Rent system to ensure that the correct amount has been included in the individual rent accounts. As a result, cash refunds could be inappropriately given and the incorrect refund amount could be put into the Rent system. | R3 All authorised refunds should be reconciled to the refunds processed through the rent system and the refund payments made through the main accounting system. | Monthly reconciliations wi financial ledger and the re Cash refunds will only situations. | 0 , |
| Refunds made by cheque and BACS are approved on refund forms. The total of each batch approved is not reconciled to the amount processed into the Rent system or to the amount paid out through the main accounting system. There is a risk that incorrect refund amounts may be paid out or processed onto the rent system. | | • | Taylor orate Debt/Income Manager une 2010 |
| | | Grade | В |



3. Housing Rents (cont'd)

Control Objective: Rent adjustments are accurately allocated to individual rent accounts Key Control: Adjustments are authorised and supported with adequate documentation

| Observation and Risk | Recommendation | Manageme | nt Response |
|---|--|--|---|
| Both the Income Management Officer and the Assistant Income Management Officer process requests for transfers and adjustments to rent accounts. Any adjustments made by the Income Management Officer are not independently reviewed. There is a risk that these adjustments may be incorrect unless there is an independent review of these. | accounts processed by one staff member | authorisation is mandatory. To be actioned by: Ken Ta | lated so that a second aylor rate Debt/Income Manager e 2010 |
| | | Grade | В |



3. Housing Rents (cont'd)

Control Objective: All applicable Council dwellings have rent charged to them Key Control: All amendments to the property masterfile are independently checked to supporting documentation.

| Observation and Risk | Recommendation | Manag | ement Response |
|---|---|--|--|
| If a property is removed from the rent masterfile, for example, as a result of a sale, demolition or conversion, this only requires an e-mail from one staff member in Estates or Legal to the Rent System team. There is a risk that property could be removed from the masterfile in error. There is no reconciliation of movements in dwellings to supporting documentation by someone independent from those in Estates, Legal and the Rent System team. Without this reconciliation there is no check to ensure that no unauthorised changes to the Rent System | R5 Controls over adjustments to the rent masterfile should be strengthened by ensuring that all requested adjustments are proposed by one staff member and approved by a more senior staff member. A reconciliation of movements in dwelling stock to supporting documentation should also be undertaken by someone independent of Estates, Legal and the Rent System team. | recommendations the can achieve the ne | n of the audit findings and e Service is considering how it cessary level of control in the anges to the Rent System. Helen Sherrit Senior Accountant |
| masterfile are made. | | No later than: | 30 June 2010 |



4. Housing and Council Tax Benefit

Control Objective: To ensure that the Housing and Council Tax Benefit system is accurate Key Control: There are adequate reviews of refunds before making payment

| Observation and Risk | Recommendation | Manag | ement Response |
|--|---|---|---|
| According to Council procedures, checks of payments should be made for: • Payments over £1,000 • 5% of payments in each payment run From our testing, we found no documentary evidence to show that all payments over £1,000 have been checked. There is a risk that large payments could be processed incorrectly. | R6 Schedules should be annotated to show that checks have been performed on all payments in excess of £1,000. Auditors comment: Action was taken to instruct all staff on this point at the time of the audit. | To be actioned by: No later than: Grade | n reinforced to staff. Helen Moir Senior Processing Officer Now in operation |



5. Non-Domestic Rates

Control Objective: To ensure that the Non-Domestic Rates (NDR) system is accurate
Key Control: There are controls to ensure all NDR payers receive a bill and a sample of bills are checked for correct calculation before sending

| Observation and Risk | Recommendation | Manageme | nt Response |
|---|--|-----------------------------|--|
| Annual billing was not fully reconciled. There is therefore a risk that the correct number of bills may not be sent out. | R7 Annual billing should be fully reconciled and documented at the time. This should also be signed off by an independent person. | To be actioned by: Ken Corp | Taylor orate Debt/Income Manager une 2010 |
| | | Grade | В |
| System information is being gathered manually on spreadsheets or handwritten notes. Staff resources to maintain records this way are no longer available. Additionally, checking data presented in this manner is time consuming and difficult. | R8 Reporting training on the Northgate system should be carried out to identify useful reports which staff are currently unaware of. Consideration should also be given to accessing a reporting tool to allow staff to extract such data as may be required to verify accuracy of the system and amendments made during the year. | To be actioned by: Ken Corp | ted to determine whether the rovided. Taylor orate Debt/Income Manager une 2010 |
| | | Grade | В |



The priority ranking helps management assess the significance of the issues raised and prioritise the action required to address them. The ranking structure is summarised as follows:

| Ranking | Definition |
|---------|--|
| Α | Fundamental issues which require the urgent consideration of senior management. |
| В | Significant matters which require the attention of line management. |
| С | Less significant matters, which do not require urgent attention but which should be followed up within a reasonable timescale. |



Appendix II – Follow-up 2008/09 Action Plan

| 1. Creditors | | | | | |
|---|--|---|--|--|--|
| Recommendation | Managen | nent Response | Update at May 2010 | | |
| R1 Exception reports identifying potential duplicate payments should be reviewed on a regular basis, and actions followed up timeously. | Agreed. A review of for the past 4 years currently being under duplicates have been investigated, and if numbers identified for below the average ide of a similar size where undertaken The Creditors Team not continue monthly in potential duplicate pays the monthly list of action be reviewed at future meetings. It is hoped that ever payment run, investificating processor BACS, thus eliminated the payment being processor BACS, thus eliminated the payment size. | potential duplicate payments to end of March 2009 is taken, and some potential dentified, and are now being appropriate recovered. The the period in question, are entified within other Councils this type of work has been on which we software available to envestigations and identifyments. This is timetabled into an to be undertaken, and will be operational team monthly entually prior to every daily gations will take place to cate payments prior to the sed and issued via Cheque nating the additional work payments from the supplier. | A review was carried out by an external consultant, covering the period April 2003 to March 2009, and identified £75,796 (19 items) to be recovered. This represents a level of processing accuracy within Accounts Payable of 99.99%. A further review is planned for later in 2010. | | |
| | To be actioned by: Financial Services Manager No later than: Now in operation. | | | | |
| | Grade | В | Fully Implemented | | |



Appendix II - Follow-up 2008/09 Action Plan

| 2. Council Tax | | | | |
|--|--|--------------|--|--|
| Recommendation | Managem | ent Response | Update at May 2010 | |
| R2 The completion of an end date and/ or review date should be mandatory in the case of time limited exemptions. | | | Procedures updated | |
| | To be actioned by: Wayne Connell No later than: 22 May 2009 | | | |
| | Grade | В | Fully Implemented | |
| R3 All adjustments should be adequately explained | Any future adjustments in this category will have a full audit trail | | ACC overpayments have been and will be refunded so there will be no consolidation in future. | |
| | To be actioned by: Ken Taylor No later than: 15 May 2009 | | | |
| | Grade | В | Fully Implemented | |



Appendix II – Follow-up 2008/09 Action Plan

Council Tax (Cont'd) 2. **Management Response** Update at May 2010 Recommendation An electronic interface between the It has been agreed with the Assessor to commence Resource issues prevented this happening in time this work in June/July 2009. but dialogue has started with the Assessor for Assessor's system and the Council Tax system should be developed and implemented. implementation in 2010/11. To be actioned by: Ken Taylor The Assessor's IT representative has retired so No later than: 17 July 2009 the process has been delayed. Not yet implemented Grade В - Revised Completion Date - 31 Dec 2010 R5 Regular reconciliations and clearance of A full resource compliment means that this task will Resources diverted at times due to other priorities suspense accounts should be programmed and now be carried out at least weekly. but action plan to clear by 31/03/10 implemented. To be actioned by: Ken Taylor No later than: 29 May 2009 Partially Implemented - balance of £39k held in suspense to be investigated during 2010/11. В Grade



Appendix II - Follow-up 2008/09 Action Plan

| 3. Housing Benefit/ Council Tax Benefit | | | | | |
|---|--|------------|-------------------|---|--|
| Recommendation | Managemen | t Response | Update | at May 2010 | |
| R6 Staff should ensure that all quality checks are undertaken on a regular basis and must not be put off more than once unless due to absence. | A planned restructure will ensure that quality | | | Restructure approved by and the Job Matching e shortly. | |
| | No later than: 29 May 2009 Grade B | | Fully Implemented | | |



Appendix III - Follow-up 2007/08 HB/ CTB Management Letter

| Recommendation | Management Response | Update May 2010 |
|---|--|--|
| R1 Enhance the level of analytical review undertaken and ensure that all analytical review comments are updated each year. | Agreed. Please provide copy of Audit Scotland Spreadsheet. | Audit Scotland Year on Year analysis spreadsheet has now been received and will be used for the 09/10 audit. |
| | To be actioned by: Ian Sutherland | |
| | No later than: 30/06/09 | Fully Implemented |
| R2 Review the system for reclassifying cases which are incorrectly included within the deregulated registered social landlord cell. This should include obtaining formal confirmation from landlords that their accommodation meets the Old Scheme requirements where applicable and having an independent review of the calculated deregulated cell adjustments for accuracy and completeness. | The onus is on the LA to make a judgement as to classification based on all the facts including relevant confirmation from landlords. Any cell adjustment is already agreed with senior Processing staff and a review of the original classification undertaken. A further independent review of the cell adjustment is not deemed necessary. To be actioned by: Ian Sutherland | social landlord the RSL register and Scottish Charity Registers are checked to ensure there is an entry for the landlord. The RSL/Rent Officer issue was raised by DWP in |
| | No later than: 31/05/09 | Fully Implemented |



Appendix III - Follow-up 2007/08 HB/ CTB Management Letter

| Recommendation | Management Response | Update May 2010 |
|--|---|--|
| R3 Reiterate to staff the need for accuracy. Where specific input errors were noted, such as with Child Tax Credits and Working Tax credits, provide extra training for staff. Checks should also be undertaken to ensure staff are correctly processing any new tax credit claims. | Agreed and already completed. Further guidance relating to Tax Credits claims in particular has already been issued to staff. Checking is ongoing. To be actioned by: Helen Moir No later than: 31/05/09 | Guidance was given to staff on these areas at their team briefings. Robohelp was updated and old guidance deleted. Tax Credit information on Robohelp was last updated in November 2009. In addition reports were run in February 2009 and February 2010 listing all cases where WTC and CTC were in payment. Checks were carried out to ensure that these cases were updated to reflect the April '09 and April '10 figures. Fully Implemented |
| R4 A sample of 2008/09 new claims and change of circumstances PI calculations should be recalculated to provide assurance that the published PI is materially correct. We suggest that a sample of 40 would be an appropriate initial sample, with further testing being undertaken if considered necessary. | We are unable to check 2008/09 PI's as these have already been submitted. However, User Performance Statistics prints are given to Processing Team Leaders on a daily basis for checking New Claims and Change of Circumstances PI's. | Team Leaders receive and check User Performance Statistical prints on a daily basis. Due to volumes these prints are not kept however, |
| For any errors noted in the sample above these should be reviewed to determine the reasons for the errors and identify ways that these errors can be avoided. Staff should then be trained so they avoid creating such errors. | To be actioned by: Helen Moir No later than: 30/06/09 | Fully Implemented |



Appendix IV - Acronyms

AECC Aberdeen Exhibition and Conference Centre PFI Private Finance Initiative

ACC Aberdeen City Council RSL Registered Social Landlord

BACS Bankers' Automated Clearing System SORP Statement of Recommended Practice

CIPFA Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy STRGL Statement of Total Recognised Gains and Losses

CRM Customer Relations Management VAT Value Added Tax

DWP Department of Work and Pensions WPRL Working Papers Requested List

FRS Financial Reporting Standards

FSAP Financial Statements Audit Plan

HB/ CTB Housing Benefit/ Council Tax Benefit

HR Human Resources

IFRIC International Financial Reporting Interpretations

Committee

IFRS International Financial Reporting Standards

ISA International Standards on Auditing

IT Information Technology

LA Local Authority

LASAAC Local Authority (Scotland) Accounts Advisory Committee

NDR Non Domestic Rates